

# **Graphs in Machine Learning**Transductive Generalization Bounds

Stability-Based Bounds for SSL

Michal Valko

Inria & ENS Paris-Saclay, MVA

Partially based on material by: Mikhail Belkin, Partha Niyo Olivier Chapelle, Bernhard Schölkopf

True risk vs. empirical risk

True risk vs. empirical risk

$$R_P(f) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i} (f_i - y_i)^2$$
  
 $\widehat{R}_P(f) = \frac{1}{n_I} \sum_{i \in I} (f_i - y_i)^2$ 

True risk vs. empirical risk

$$R_P(f) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i} (f_i - y_i)^2$$

$$\widehat{R}_P(f) = \frac{1}{n_I} \sum_{i \in I} (f_i - y_i)^2$$

We look for transductive bounds in the form

$$R_P(f) \leq \widehat{R}_P(f) + \text{errors}$$

Bounding transductive error using stability analysis

http://www.cs.nyu.edu/~mohri/pub/str.pdf

Bounding transductive error using stability analysis

http://www.cs.nyu.edu/~mohri/pub/str.pdf

How to bound  $(f_i - y_i)^2$ ?

Bounding transductive error using stability analysis

http://www.cs.nyu.edu/~mohri/pub/str.pdf

How to bound  $(f_i - y_i)^2$ ?

We bound  $(\ell_i^{\star} - y_i)^2$  with soft HFS (hard HFS is difficult):

Bounding transductive error using stability analysis

http://www.cs.nyu.edu/~mohri/pub/str.pdf

How to bound  $(f_i - y_i)^2$ ?

We bound  $(\ell_i^{\star} - y_i)^2$  with soft HFS (hard HFS is difficult):

$$\boldsymbol{\ell}^{\star} = \min_{\boldsymbol{\ell} \in \mathbb{R}^{N}} \; (\boldsymbol{\ell} - \mathbf{y})^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{C} (\boldsymbol{\ell} - \mathbf{y}) + \boldsymbol{\ell}^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{Q} \boldsymbol{\ell}$$

Bounding transductive error using stability analysis

http://www.cs.nyu.edu/~mohri/pub/str.pdf

How to bound  $(f_i - y_i)^2$ ?

We bound  $(\ell_i^{\star} - y_i)^2$  with soft HFS (hard HFS is difficult):

$$\boldsymbol{\ell}^{\star} = \min_{\boldsymbol{\ell} \in \mathbb{R}^{N}} \ (\boldsymbol{\ell} - \mathbf{y})^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{C} (\boldsymbol{\ell} - \mathbf{y}) + \boldsymbol{\ell}^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{Q} \boldsymbol{\ell}$$

Closed form solution

$$\ell^{\star} = \left(\mathbf{C}^{-1}\mathbf{Q} + \mathbf{I}\right)^{-1}\mathbf{y}$$

Consider two datasets differing in exactly one labeled point.

Consider two datasets differing in exactly one labeled point.

$$m{\ell}_1^\star=(\mathbf{C}_1^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_1$$
 and  $m{\ell}_2^\star=(\mathbf{C}_2^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_2$ 

Consider two datasets differing in exactly one *labeled* point.

$$m{\ell}_1^\star=(\mathbf{C}_1^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_1$$
 and  $m{\ell}_2^\star=(\mathbf{C}_2^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_2$ 

What is the maximal difference  $\beta \ge \|\boldsymbol{\ell}_2^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_1^{\star}\|_{\infty}$  in the solutions?

Consider two datasets differing in exactly one labeled point.

$$m{\ell}_1^\star=(\mathbf{C}_1^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_1$$
 and  $m{\ell}_2^\star=(\mathbf{C}_2^{-1}\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{I})^{-1}\mathbf{y}_2$ 

What is the maximal difference  $\beta \ge \|\ell_2^{\star} - \ell_1^{\star}\|_{\infty}$  in the solutions?

By the generalization bound of Belkin [belkin2004regularization], w.p.1  $-\delta$ 

http://web.cse.ohio-state.edu/~mbelkin/papers/RSS\_COLT\_04.pdf

$$R_P(\ell^\star) \leq \widehat{R}_P(\ell^\star) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_I}}(n_I\beta + 4)}_{\text{transductive error }\Delta_T(\beta, n_I, \delta)}.$$

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_2^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_1^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta}}{\boldsymbol{\beta}} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_2 - \mathbf{y}_1\|_2}{\frac{\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_M(\mathbf{C}_1)} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_1^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_2^{-1}\|_2 \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_1\|_2}{\left(\frac{\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_M(\mathbf{C}_2)} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_M(\mathbf{C}_1)} + 1\right)}$$

#### Bounding transductive error

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta}}{2} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \underline{\boldsymbol{\beta}} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that 
$$\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$$
 and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ .

#### Bounding transductive error

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta}}{2} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that 
$$\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$$
 and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$ 

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \underline{\boldsymbol{\beta}} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that  $\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$  and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$  and  $c_l > c_u$ .

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \underline{\beta} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that  $\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$  and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$  and  $c_l > c_u$ . We have  $|y_i| \le 1$ 

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \underline{\boldsymbol{\beta}} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that  $\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$  and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$  and  $c_l > c_u$ . We have  $|y_i| \le 1$  and  $|\ell_i^*| \le 1$ .

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{\beta}{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that  $\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$  and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$  and  $c_l > c_u$ . We have  $|y_i| \le 1$  and  $|\ell_i^{\star}| \le 1$ .

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_g + 1} + \sqrt{2n_l} \frac{1 - c_u}{c_u} \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g}{\gamma_g^2 + 1} \right]$$

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$\|\boldsymbol{\ell}_{2}^{\star} - \boldsymbol{\ell}_{1}^{\star}\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta}}{\Delta_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} \leq \frac{\|\mathbf{y}_{2} - \mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1} + \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{Q})\|\mathbf{C}_{1}^{-1} - \mathbf{C}_{2}^{-1}\|_{2} \cdot \|\mathbf{y}_{1}\|_{2}}{\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{2})} + 1\right)\left(\frac{\lambda_{m}(\mathbf{Q})}{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{C}_{1})} + 1\right)}$$

Now, let us plug in the values for our problem.

Remember that  $\lambda_m(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_m(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$  and  $\lambda_M(\mathbf{Q}) = \lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g$ . Take  $c_l = 1$  and  $c_l > c_u$ . We have  $|y_i| \le 1$  and  $|\ell_i^{\star}| \le 1$ .

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_g + 1} + \sqrt{2n_l} \frac{1 - c_u}{c_u} \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g}{\gamma_g^2 + 1} \right]$$

This algorithm is  $\beta$ -stable!

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_{P}(\ell^{\star}) \leq \widehat{R}_{P}(\ell^{\star}) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_{I}}(n_{I}\beta + 4)}}_{\text{transductive error } \Delta_{T}(\beta, n_{I}, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_{g} + 1} + \sqrt{2n_{I}} \frac{1 - c_{u}}{c_{u}} \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_{g}}{\gamma_{g}^{2} + 1} \right]$$

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_P(\ell^*) \leq \widehat{R}_P(\ell^*) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_I}}(n_I\beta + 4)}_{\text{transductive error }\Delta_T(\beta, n_I, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_g + 1} + \sqrt{2n_l} \frac{1 - c_u}{c_u} \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g}{\gamma_g^2 + 1} \right]$$

Does the bound say anything useful?

1) The error is controlled.

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_P(\ell^*) \leq \widehat{R}_P(\ell^*) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_I}}(n_I\beta + 4)}_{\text{transductive error }\Delta_T(\beta, n_I, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_g + 1} + \sqrt{2n_l} \frac{1 - c_u}{c_u} \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g}{\gamma_g^2 + 1} \right]$$

- 1) The error is controlled.
- **2)** Practical when error  $\Delta_T(\beta, n_l, \delta)$  decreases at rate  $O(n_l^{-\frac{1}{2}})$ .

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_{P}(\ell^{\star}) \leq \widehat{R}_{P}(\ell^{\star}) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_{I}}(n_{I}\beta + 4)}}_{\text{transductive error } \Delta_{T}(\beta, n_{I}, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_{g} + 1} + \sqrt{2n_{I}} \frac{1 - c_{u}}{c_{u}} \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_{g}}{\gamma_{g}^{2} + 1} \right]$$

- 1) The error is controlled.
- **2)** Practical when error  $\Delta_T(\beta, n_l, \delta)$  decreases at rate  $O(n_l^{-\frac{1}{2}})$ . Achieved when  $\beta = O(1/n_l)$ .

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_P(\ell^*) \leq \widehat{R}_P(\ell^*) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_I}}(n_I\beta + 4)}_{\text{transductive error }\Delta_T(\beta, n_I, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_g + 1} + \sqrt{2n_l} \frac{1 - c_u}{c_u} \frac{\lambda_M(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_g}{\gamma_g^2 + 1} \right]$$

- 1) The error is controlled.
- **2)** Practical when error  $\Delta_T(\beta, n_l, \delta)$  decreases at rate  $O(n_l^{-\frac{1}{2}})$ . Achieved when  $\beta = O(1/n_l)$ . That is,  $\gamma_g = \Omega(n_l^{\frac{3}{2}})$ .

#### **Bounding transductive error**

$$R_P(\ell^*) \leq \widehat{R}_P(\ell^*) + \underbrace{\beta + \sqrt{\frac{2\ln(2/\delta)}{n_I}}(n_I\beta + 4)}_{\text{transductive error }\Delta_T(\beta, n_I, \delta)}$$

$$\beta \leq 2 \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\gamma_{g} + 1} + \sqrt{2n_{l}} \frac{1 - c_{u}}{c_{u}} \frac{\lambda_{M}(\mathbf{L}) + \gamma_{g}}{\gamma_{g}^{2} + 1} \right]$$

#### Does the bound say anything useful?

- 1) The error is controlled.
- **2)** Practical when error  $\Delta_T(\beta, n_l, \delta)$  decreases at rate  $O(n_l^{-\frac{1}{2}})$ . Achieved when  $\beta = O(1/n_l)$ . That is,  $\gamma_g = \Omega(n_l^{\frac{3}{2}})$ .

We have an idea how to set  $\gamma_g$ !

# Michal Valko

michal.valko@inria.fr Inria & ENS Paris-Saclay, MVA

https://misovalko.github.io/mva-ml-graphs.html